2011

የሒሳብ ምርመራ አንልግሎት ኮርፖሬሽን



AUDIT SERVICES

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT NO.5766-ET MANAGEMENT LETTER FOR THE YEAR ENDED 7 JULY 2019



በኢትዮጵያ ፌዴራሳዊ ዲሞክራሲያዊ ሪፐብሊክ የሂሣብ ምርመራ አንልግሎት ኮርፖሬሽን

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Audit Services Corporation

6 January 2020

The Minister Ministry of Finance Addis Ababa

Dear Sir,

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET MANAGEMENT LETTER FOR THE YEAR ENDED 7 JULY 2019

We hereby submit our findings and recommendations on weaknesses in internal control and other matters which came to our attention during the audit of the financial statements of Ministry of Finance, Public Financial Management Project, financed under IDA Credit No. 5766-ET (hereinafter referred to as the Project) for the year ended 7 July 2019.

We attach the following for reference:

Independent auditor's report Balance Sheet Statement of sources and uses of funds Notes to the financial statements Designated account statement

As part of our audit of the Project, we have visited:

- Ministry of Finance
- Public Procurement and Property Administration Agency (PPPAA)
- Oromia National Regional State, Bureau of Finance and Economic Cooperation.

It must be appreciated that the matters dealt with in this report came to our attention during the conduct of our normal audit procedures which are designed primarily with a view to the expression of our opinion on the financial statements of the Project and therefore our examination cannot be expected to disclose all possible weaknesses in internal control and to uncover all other findings which a more extensive special examination might reveal.

CASH AND BANK BALANCES

Finding

1.1 The bank reconciliation statement for bank account No. 0100101040682 of Public Procurement and Property Administration Agency was noted to have been erroneously prepared as the book balance of Birr 9,548,528 considered for the reconciliation preparation was incorrect while the correct one being Birr 9,880,456.

Management's Response

Corrective action will be taken and the issue will be solved in future.

Implication

Control weakness.

Recommendation

The reconciliation statement should be revised taking the correct details of reconciliation transactions.

1.2. In our review of reconciliation statements of bank accounts at the Public Procurement and Property Administration Agency we also noted instances whereby reconciliation statements were not signed for an independent checking and approval.

Implication

Control weakness.

Management's Response

No response.

Recommendation

All reconciliation statements should be checked and approved by an independent person for a better control over the accounts.

GENERAL

Finding

2.1 In the books of accounts of Public Procurement and Property Administration Agency and Oromia National Regional State, we noted that some payment vouchers and respective supporting documents were not stamped as having been "PAID".

Management's Response

It will be resolved by discussing with the Agency's accountant.

Implication

Control weakness over payments.

Recommendation

In order to preclude their possible representation for payment, payment documents should be stamped "PAID".

CONCLUSION

We would like to express our appreciation to the management and staff of the Project for the assistance and courtesy extended to our representatives during the course of our audit.

We have discussed this report with the management of the Project who, in general, accept our findings and recommendations. We shall be pleased to provide any further explanations that may be required.

Yours faithfully,

andit services corporation



በኢትዮጵያ ፌዴራሳዊ ዲሞክራሲያዊ ሪፐብሊክ የሂሣብ ምርመራ አንልግሎት ኮርፖሬሽን

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Audit Services Corporation

INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORT ON THE FINANCIAL STATEMENTS OF MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET

We have audited the accompanying financial statements of Ministry of Finance, Public Financial Management Project, financed under IDA credit No. 5766-ET, which comprise the balance sheet as at 7 July 2019, and the statement of sources and uses of funds for the year then ended, and a summary of significant accounting policies and other explanatory information.

Management's Responsibility for the Financial Statements

The Project's management is responsible for the preparation and fair presentation of these financial statements in accordance with the Ethiopian Government's Manual of the Federal Accounting System which is based on a modified cash basis of accounting and, for such internal controls as management determines is necessary to enable the preparation of financial statements that are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error.

Auditor's Responsibility

Our responsibility is to express an opinion on these financial statements based on our audit. We conducted our audit in accordance with International Standards on Auditing. Those standards require that we comply with ethical requirements and plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the financial statements are free from material misstatement.

An audit involves performing procedures to obtain audit evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the financial statements. The procedures selected depend on the auditor's judgment, including the assessment of the risks of material misstatement of the financial statements, whether due to fraud or error. In making those risk assessments, the auditor considers internal control relevant to the entity's preparation and fair presentation of the circumstances, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the entity's internal control. An audit also includes evaluating the appropriateness of accounting policies used and the reasonableness of accounting estimates made by management, as well as evaluating the overall presentation of the financial statements.

We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our audit opinion.

(IM

251-011-5515222 251-011-5535012 251-011-5535015 251-011-5535016

Fax 251-011-5513083

⊠ 5720

INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORT ON THE FINANCIAL STATEMENTS OF MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET (continued)

Opinion

In our opinion, the financial statements give a true and fair view of the financial position of Ministry of Finance, Public Financial Management Project, financed under IDA Credit No. 5766-ET as at 7 July 2019 and of its sources and uses of funds for the year then ended in accordance with the Ethiopian Government's Manual of the Federal Accounting System which is based on a modified cash basis of accounting.

Report on Other Requirements

As required by the World Bank Guidelines and the terms of reference for financial audit, we report that, to the extent we can assess:

- a) All external financing has been used in accordance with the conditions of the relevant financing agreements with due attention to economy and efficiency, and only for the purposes for which the financing was provided;
- b) Goods, works and services financed have been procured in accordance with the relevant financing agreements;
- c) All necessary supporting documents, records and accounts have been maintained in respect of all project activities;
- d) Designated accounts have been maintained in accordance with the provisions of the relevant financing agreements, and funds disbursed out of the accounts were used for the purposes intended in the financing agreement;
- e) National laws and regulations have been complied with, and that the financial and accounting procedures approved for the Project were followed and used; and
- f) Financial performance of the Project is satisfactory.

audit services cosporation

6 January 2020

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET BALANCE SHEET AS AT 7JULY 2019

CURRENT ASSETS	Notes	2019 Ethiopian Birr	2018 Ethiopian Birr
Accounts receivable Cash and bank balances	3 4	23,716,395 <u>114,269,107</u> 137,985,502	9,235,965 <u>125,898,263</u> 135,134,228
CURRENT LIABILITIES Accounts payable Taxes payable	5	689,160 <u>433,321</u> <u>1,122,481</u>	805,971 <u>25,940</u> <u>831,911</u>
NET CURRENT ASSETS		<u>136,863,021</u>	<u>134,302,317</u>
REPRESENTED BY			
FUND BALANCE	7	<u>136,863,021</u>	<u>134,302,317</u>

The notes on pages 7 to 10 form an integral part of these financial statements

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET STATEMENT OF SOURCES AND USES OF FUNDS FOR THE YEAR ENDED 7JULY 2019

SOURCES	2019 Ethiopian Birr	Cumulative from 8 July 2016 to 7July 2019 Ethiopian Birr	2018 Ethiopian Birr	
IDA - IFR Procedures Gain on foreign exchange	147,651,305 <u>5,777,054</u> 153,428,359	463,283,433 <u>9,798,458</u> 473,081,891	173,191,599 <u>3,067,032</u> 176,258,631	
USES				
Expenditure Management and				
information system support	109,257,488	249,895,613	78,135,895	
Strengthening Accountability Institution Program Management, Monitoring and	31,476,132	73,427,898	18,348,503	
Evaluation	<u>10,134,035</u>	12,895,359	887,322	
	<u>150,867,655</u>	<u>336,218,870</u>	97,371,720	
EXCESS OF SOURCES OVER USES	<u>2,560,704</u>	<u>136,863,021</u>	<u>78,886,911</u>	

The notes on pages 7 to 10 form an integral part of these financial statements

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET DESIGNATED ACCOUNT STATEMENT

For year ended Account number Depository bank Address Related credit Currency

7 July 2019 0100101300538 National Bank of Ethiopia Addis Ababa, Ethiopia IDA 5766-ET USD

	201	9	2	018
Beginning balance - 7 July 2018 Advance received - IFR Procedures Less:	USD 2,771,773.20 <u>5,286,011.78</u> 8,057,784.98	Ethiopian Birr 75,632,266.60 <u>147,651,304.81</u> 223,283,571.41	USD 1,251,606.03 <u>6,386,825.64</u> 7,638,431.67	Ethiopian Birr 28,948,270.71 <u>173,191,598.88</u> 202,139,869.59
Transfer to Birr account Transfer to MoF - Finance Add:	4,800,000.00 <u>1,277,907.59</u> <u>6,077,907.59</u> 1,979,877.39	135,044,520.00 <u>35,912,999.04</u> <u>170,957,519.04</u> 52,326,052.37	4,000,000.00 <u>866,658.47</u> <u>4,866,658.47</u> 2,771,773.20	108,549,500.00 <u>20,974,978.75</u> <u>129,524,478.75</u> 72,615,390.84
Gain on foreign exchange		<u>4,965,461.68</u>		<u>3,016,875.76</u>
Ending balance - 7 July 2019	<u>1,979,877.39</u>	<u>57,291,514.05</u>	<u>2,771,773.20</u>	75,632,266.60

5

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766- ET SCHEDULE OF MOVEMENTS IN BIRR ACCOUNT

For year ended Account number Depository bank Address

7 July 2019 0100101040680 National Bank of Ethiopia Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Ethiopian Birr

Currency

	2019 Ethiopian Birr	2018 Ethiopian Birr
Beginning balance - 7 July 2018	13,563,260	9,154,354
Transfer from USD designated Account	135,044,520	108,549,500
	148,607,780	117,703,854
Less: Transfers to Project implementing agencies -		
(Regions and other Government offices)		
Tigray	7,096,170	3,443,839
Afar	2,831,824	2,063,851
Amhara	8,927,188	7,386,600
Oromia	16,500,453	11,217,369
Somali	5,003,893	3,820,943
Benshangul Gumuz	1,875,153	1,023,683
SNNPR	7,692,390	6,608,442
Gambella	3,205,774	1,318,618
Harari	1,182,342	491,204
Dire Dawa	1,894,516	786,388
Addis Ababa	5,973,817	3,524,476
Ministry of Finance - Finance	37,448,389	52,914,718
Office of the Federal Auditor General (OFAG)	8,866,003	1,100,000
Public Procurement and Property Administration -		
Agency (PPPAA)	18,607,296	8,169,090
Accounting and Auditing Board of Ethiopia	4,320,000	-
	131,425,208	103,869,221
Bank service charge	<u>337,611</u>	<u>271,373</u>
	<u>131,762,819</u>	104,140,594
Ending balance – 7 July 2019	<u>16,844,960</u>	<u>13,563,260</u>

6

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET NOTES TO THE FINANCIAL STATEMENTS

1. PROJECT INFORMATION

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia and the International Development Association (IDA) entered into an agreement dated 17 March 2016 to finance the Public Financial Management Project. The latter agreed to extend to the former a credit in an amount equivalent to SDR 23,900,000 to assist in financing the mentioned Project.

The objective of the Project is to improve the efficiency, transparency and accountability of Public expenditures of the Government at the federal and regional levels.

The Project consists of the following parts:

Part A: Improving Expenditure management and Information System Part B: Strengthening Accountability Institutions Part C: Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation.

The effective date of the Project is 18 May 2016 and its closing date shall be 7 April 2020.

2. SIGNIFICANT ACCOUNTIG POLICIES

The principal accounting policies adopted by the Project are stated below:

a) Basis of preparation

These financial statements have been prepared in accordance with the Ethiopian Government's Manual of the Federal Accounting System which is based on a modified cash basis of accounting.

b) Currency

These financial statements are presented in Birr. Transactions in foreign currencies are translated into Birr at the approximate rates of exchange prevailing at the dates of the transactions. Foreign currency balances are translated into Birr at the exchange rates ruling at the balance sheet date.

7

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET NOTES TO THE FINANCIAL STATEMENTS (continued)

3. ACCOUNTS RECEIVABLE

Advance to Government and Regional Offices Purchase advance Other advances Staff debtors	2019 Ethiopian Birr 6,106,685 17,450,040 124,722 <u>34,948</u> 23,716,395	2018 Ethiopian Birr 9,207,308 6,418 - 22,239 <u>9,235,965</u>
CASH AND BANK BALANCES		
USD Account No.0100101300538 Birr Account No. 0100101040680 Ministry of Finance - Finance Public Procurement and Property Administration Agency Office of the Federal Auditor General Accounting and Auditing Board of Ethiopia Cash at bank at Regional Offices Cash on hand	$57,291,514 \\ 16,844,960 \\ 6,275,457 \\ 9,661,377 \\ 9,301,422 \\ 538,747 \\ \underline{14,196,933} \\ 114,110,410 \\ \underline{158,697} \\ \end{array}$	75,632,267 13,563,260 22,133,434 4,626,717 1,080,101 - <u>8,749,816</u> 125,785,595 <u>112,668</u>
	<u>114,269,107</u>	<u>125,898,263</u>

5. ACCOUNTS PAYABLE

4.

Payable to Government Offices Other payable

	and a second sec
265,419	513,756
<u>423,741</u>	<u>292,215</u>
<u>689,160</u>	<u>805,971</u>

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET NOTES TO THE FINANCIAL STATEMENTS (continued)

6. TAXES PAYABLE

	2019 Ethiopian Bi	2018 Iirr Ethiopian Birr
Value added tax Withholding tax	424,0 <u>9,2</u>	
	<u>433,3</u>	<u>221</u> <u>25,940</u>

7. ACCUMULATED FUND

	Ethiopian Birr
Balance at 7 July 2018	134,302,317
Add: Excess of financing over expenditure for the year	<u>2,560,704</u>
	<u>136,863,021</u>

8. DATE OF AUTHORIZATION

The Director, Channel One Programs Coordinating Directorate of the Ministry authorized the issue of these financial statements on 6 January 2020.

MINISTRY OF FINANCE PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PROJECT IDA CREDIT No. 5766-ET IFR WITHDRAWAL SCHEDULE

for applications submitted during the year ended 7 July 2019

Application	<u>Amount requested</u>	<u>Amount disbursed</u>	<u>Equivalent in</u>
<u>No.</u>	<u>USD</u>	<u>USD</u>	<u>Ethiopian Birr</u>
PFM-10	1,862,476.48	1,862,476.48	51,811,488.21
PFM-11	<u>3,423,535.30</u>	<u>3,423,535.30</u>	<u>95,839,816.60</u>
	<u>5,286,011.78</u>	<u>5,286,011,78</u>	<u>147,651,304.81</u>